

**BEFORE THE JUDICIAL PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION**

----- X  
:  
:  
:  
**In re Pet Foods Products Liability Litigation** MDL - 1850  
:  
:  
:  
----- X

2007 AUG -2 P 3:31  
3:07CV00159-CRA-VIC

**JOINT MOTION TO VACATE CONDITIONAL TRANSFER ORDER**

Defendants Sunshine Mills, Inc., Menu Foods, Inc., and Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. respectfully move this Panel, pursuant to Rule 7.4(d) of the Rules of Procedure of the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation, for an order vacating its June 28, 2007 order conditionally transferring to this MDL the Picus v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. et al. case, number 2:07-cv-00682-PMP-LRL, and remanding the case to the United States District Court for the District of Nevada. The Undersigned has consulted with counsel for Sunshine Mills, Inc. and Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. and, at their request, asks that that these parties be deemed as joining in this Joint Motion.

As discussed more fully in Defendants' Brief in Support of Joint Motion to Vacate Conditional Transfer Order, the Panel should vacate its prior order conditionally transferring the Picus case to the MDL because the Picus case involves fundamentally different questions of law and fact than the other cases in this MDL. Transfer will not conserve the resources of the parties, their counsel, and the judiciary because, unlike the other MDL cases, the Picus case is not a products liability case, does not relate to allegedly contaminated pet food, does not involve alleged injuries to pets, and does not involve a similar class of plaintiffs.

WHEREFORE Defendants respectfully request that the Panel vacate its June 28, 2007 order conditionally transferring the to this MDL the Picus v. Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. et al. case,

number 2:07-cv-00682-PMP-LRL, and request that this case be remanded to the United States District Court for the District of Nevada.

Dated: July 30, 2007

DLA PIPER US LLP

1251 Avenue of the Americas, 27th Floor  
New York, NY 10020-1104  
212-335-4500

By: Amy W. Schulman, meo

Amy W. Schulman  
Attorneys for Defendant Menu Foods, Inc.

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that she served a copy of the foregoing Joint Motion to Vacate Conditional Transfer Order to the following via U.S. mail, postage prepaid, on July 30, 2007:

Lawrence T. Osuch  
GERARD & OSUCH, LLP  
2840 South Jones Boulevard  
Building D, Suite 4  
Las Vegas, NV 89146

Robert B. Gerard  
GERARD & OSUCH, LLP  
2840 South Jones Boulevard  
Building D, Suite 4  
Las Vegas, NV 89146

Norman Blumenthal  
BLUMENTHAL & MARKHAM  
2255 Calle Clara  
La Jolla, CA 92037-3107

**ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF**

Clerk of the United States District Court  
District of Nevada – Las Vegas  
333 Las Vegas Boulevard  
Las Vegas, NV 89101

And all parties on the attached Panel Service List.

*Amy W. Schulman, mso*  
Amy W. Schulman

-PAGE 1 OF 4

**INVOLVED COUNSEL LIST (CTO-I) DOCKET NO. 1850 IN RE PET  
FOOD PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION**

Charles H. Abbott Gibson Dunn & Crutcher 333 South Grand Avenue 45th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071-3197	Anthony G. Brazil Morris, Polich & Purdy, LLP 1055 West Seventh Street 24th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90017-2503	James L. Davidson Lerach Coughlin Stoia Geller Rudman & Robbins, LLP 120 East Palmetto Park Road Suite 500 Boca Raton, FL 33432
John H. Alexander John H. Alexander & Associates 100 West Monroe Street Suite 2100 Chicago, IL 60603	Jeniphr A.E. Breckinridge Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro, LLP 1301 Fifth Avenue Suite 2900 Seattle, WA 98101	Larry D. Drury Larry D. Drury, Ltd. 205 West Randolph Street Suite 1430 Chicago, IL 60606
Thomas C. Angelone Hodosh, Spinella & Angelone One Turks Head Place Suite 1050 Providence, RI 02903-1516	Rachel Laine Carnaggio Godfrey & Lapuyade, P.C. 9557 South Kingston Court Englewood, CO 80112-5952	John G. Emerson Emerson Poynter, LLP 830 Apollo Lane Houston, TX 77058
Rene Lynn Barge Class Action Litigation Group 11111 Santa Monica Blvd Los Angeles, CA 90025	Paul C. Catos Thompson & Bowie Three Canal Plaza P.O. Box 4630 Portland, ME 04112	Thomas M. Ferlauto King & Ferlauto 1880 Century Park East Suite 820 Los Angeles, CA 90067-1627
George S. Bellas Bellas & Wachowski 15 North Northwest Highway Park Ridge, IL 60068	Ilan J. Chorowsky Chorowsky Law Offices 1130 N. Dearborn Street Suite 3110 Chicago, IL 60610	Luis Guillermo Figueiroa Attorneys Trial Group 540 North Semoran Blvd. Orlando, FL 32807
Eric J. Benink Krause, Kalfayan, Benink & Slavens, LLP 625 Broadway Suite 635 San Diego, CA 92101	Christy Comstock 21 West Mountain Street Suite 300 Fayetteville, AR 72701	Jack Michael Fribley Fagre & Benson, LLP 90 South Seventh Street Suite 2200 Minneapolis, MN 55402-3901
Steve W. Berman Hagens Berman Sobol Shapiro, LLP 1301 Fifth Avenue Suite 2900 Seattle, WA 98101	Barbara L. Croutch Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw & Pittman 725 South Figueroa Street Suite 1200 Los Angeles, CA 90017	Andrew H. Friedman Helmer Friedman 723 Ocean Front Walk Venice, CA 90291
Bruce S. Bistline Gordon Law Offices 623 West Hays Street Boise, ID 83702-5512	Brian R. Cunha Brian Cunha & Associates 311 Pine Street Fall River, MA 02720	Wendi J. Frisch Morris, Polich & Purdy, LLP 1055 West 7th Street Suite 2400 Los Angeles, CA 90017
Garrett D. Blanchfield, Jr. Reinhardt, Wendorf & Blanchfield 332 Minnesota Street Suite E-1250 St. Paul, MN 55101		

## INVOLVED COUNSEL LIST(CTO-I) MDL-1850

PAGE 2 OF 4

Jeremy Gilman Benesch, Friedlander, Coplan & Aronoff 2300 BP Tower 200 Public Square Cleveland, OH 44114-2378	Mick D. Hodges Peterson Hodges & Harper P.O. Box 3088 Twin Falls, ID 83303-5298	Jeffrey T. Kestle Gardner, Bond, Trabolsi, St. Louis & Clement 2200 Sixth Avenue Suite 600 Seattle, WA 98121
Paul Gordon Paul Gordon, LLC 650 South Cherry Street Suite 835 Denver, CO 80246	Charles H. Hom Wright, Robinson, Osthimer & Tatum 44 Montgomery Street 18th Floor San Francisco, CA 94104	Michael S. Kreidler Stich, Angell, Kreidler & Dodge, P.A. The Crossings, Suite 120 250 Second Avenue South Minneapolis, MN 55401
Patrick J. Goss Rose Law Firm 120 East Fourth Street Little Rock, AR 72201	William Gene Horton Nolan, Caddell & Reynolds, P.A. 122 North 11th Street Post Office Box 184 Fort Smith, AR 72902-0184	Paul F. Linn Michael Best & Friedrich, LLP 100 E. Wisconsin Ave, Suite. 3300 Milwaukee, WI 53202
Thomas R. Grande 400 Davis Levin Livingston Grande Pl. 851 Fort Street, Suite 400 Honolulu, HI 96813-4317	Don Howarth Howarth & Smith 523 West Sixth Street Suite 729 Los Angeles, CA 90014	Carrie Ann Lubinski Gordon & Rees, LLP Embarcadero Center West 275 Battery Street 20th Floor San Francisco, CA 94111
Daniel E. Gustafson Gustafson Gluek PLLC 608 Second Avenue South Suite 650 Minneapolis, MN 55402	Brian S. Inamtnne Wright, Robinson, Osthimer & Tatum 888 South Figueroa Street Suite 600 Los Angeles, CA 90017	Gary E. Mason Mason Law Firm, P.C. 1225 19th Street, N.W. Suite 500 Washington, D.C. 20036
Susan M. Hack Higgs, Fletcher & Mack, LLP 401 West A Street Suite 2600 San Diego, CA 92101-1406	D. Jeffrey Ireland Faruki, Ireland & Cox, P.L.L. 500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W. 10 North Ludlow Street Dayton, OH 45402	Edward T. Matthews Fredrikson & Byron 200 South 6th Street Suite 4000 Minneapolis, MN 55402-1425
Jason Matthew Hatfield Lundy & Davis, LLP 300 North College Avenue Suite 309 Fayetteville, AR 72701	Frank Jablonski Progressive Law Group, LLC 354 West Main Street Madison, WI 53703	John J. McDonough Cozen O'Connor, LLP 45 Broadway Atrium Suite 1600 New York, NY 10006
Bradley T. Hayes 804 State Street Natchez, MS 39120	Christopher D. Jennings Emerson Poynter, LLP The Museum Center, Suite 305 500 President Clinton Avenue Little Rock, AR 72201	Robert D. McIntosh Adorno & Yoss, LLP 888 SE 3rd Avenue Suite 500 Ft. Lauderdale, FL 33316-1159
Bradley David Hergott Scandaglia & Ryan 55 East Monroe Street Suite 3930 Chicago, IL 60603	Robert A. Jigarjian Jigarjian Law Office 128 Tunstead Avenue San Anselmo, CA 94960	
Harold M. Hewell Hewell Law Firm 402 West Broadway Fourth Floor San Diego, CA 92101		

## INVOLVED COUNSEL LIST (CTO-1) MDL-1850

PAGE 3 OF 4

Jennifer L. McKeegan Gallagher, Sharp, Fulton & Norman Bulkley Building 6th Floor 1501 Euclid Avenue Cleveland, OH 44115	Allison Beth Neidoff Gibbons, PC One Pennsylvania Plaza 37th Floor New York, NY 10119-3701	Terry M. Poynter P.O. Box 370 Mountain Home, AR 72654-0370
Steven J. Merker Dorsey & Whitney LLP 370 17th Street Republic Plaza Building Suite 4700 Denver, CO 80202-5647	Gregory M. Nespole Wolf Haldenstein Adler Freeman & Herz LLP 270 Madison Avenue 11th Floor New York, NY 10016	Andrae P. Reneau Wexler Toriseva Wallace, LLP One North LaSalle Street Suite 2000 Chicago, IL 60602
Ethan A. Miller Squire, Sanders & Dempsey, L.L.P. One Maritime Plaza Suite 300 San Francisco, CA 94111	Marshall S. Ney Mitchell, Williams, Selig, Gates & Woodyard, PLLC 5414 Pinnacle Point Drive Suite 500 Rogers, AR 72758	Eugene R. Richard Wayne Richard & Hurwitz, LLP One Boston Place Suite 3620 Boston, MA 02108
Daniel J. Mitchell Bernstein Shur 100 Middle Street P.O. Box 9729 Portland, ME 04104-5029	William M. O'Mara O'Mara Law Firm, P.C. 311 East Liberty Street Reno, NV 89501	Steven Lee Rodriguez Cozen & O'Connor 425 California Street Suite 2400 San Francisco, CA 94104
J. Chad Moore 270 Market Street Millersburg, PA 17061	Gina E. Och Murchison & Dimming Chase Plaza 801 South Grand Avenue 9th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90017-4613	Daniel L. Rottinghaus Berding & Weil 3240 Stone Valley Road West Alamo, CA 94507
Michael S. Morrison Schonbrun DeSimone Seplow Harris & Hoffman 723 Ocean Front Walk Venice, CA 90291-3270	Katherine J. Odenbreit Class Action Litigation Group 13123 Garden Land Road Los Angeles, CA 90049	Steven E. Schwarz Law Offices of Steven E. Schwarz 2461 W. Foster Avenue #1W Chicago, IL 60625
John F. Mullen Cozen O'Connor 1900 Market Street Fourth Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103-3508	Bertram V. Parekh Kirtland & Packard, LLP 2361 Rosecrans Blvd 4th Floor E1 Segundo, CA 90245-4923	Richard Mark Segal Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw & Pittman 101 West Broadway Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101
Dennis E. Murray Sr. Murray & Murray Co., LPA 111 East Shoreline Dr. P.O. Box 19 Sandusky, OH 44871	David C. Parisi Parisi & Havens 15233 Valleyheart Drive Sherman Oaks, CA 91403	Scott R. Shepherd Shepherd, Finkelman, Miller & Shah, LLC 4400 North Federal Highway Suite 200 Lighthouse Point, FL 33064
Michael David Myers Myers & Co., PLLC 1809 Seventh Avenue Suite 700 Seattle, WA 98101	David A. Payne Tom W. Cardin, P.C. 607 Main Street Cassville, MO 65625	Charles W. Spann Perry & Spann 6130 Plumas Street Reno, NV 89509

## INVOLVED COUNSEL LIST (CTO-1) MDL-1850

PAGE 4 OF 4

Dan Charming Stanley Stanley & Kurtz, PLLC 422 South Gay Street Third Floor Knoxville, TN 37902	Jeffrey R. Thompson O'Neil, Parker & Williamson 416 Cumberland Avenue, S.W. P.O. Box 217 Knoxville, TN 37902	Nicholas M. Wieczorek Morris Polich & Purdy, LLP 3980 Howard Hughes Parkway Suite 400 Las Vegas, NV 89109
Michael L. Stoker Johns, Flaherty & Rice, S.C. 205 Fifth Avenue South Suite 600 P.O. Box 1626 La Crosse, WI 54602	Adam T. Waskowski Lord, Bissell & Brook, LLP 111 South Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60606	Cheryl A. Williams Milberg Weiss & Bershad One California Plaza 300 South Grand Avenue Suite 3900 Los Angeles, CA 90071
Stuart C. Talley Kershaw, Cutter & Ratinoff LLP 980 9th Street 19th Floor Sacramento, CA 95814-2719	Peter N. Waslyuk Law Offices of Peter N. Waslyuk 1307 Chalkstone Avenue Providence, RI 02908	Shawn A. Williams Millberg Weiss Bershad Hynes & Lerach, LLP 100 Pine Street, Suite 2600 San Francisco, CA 94111
Kenneth A. Wexler Wexler, Toriseva, Wallace, LLP 1610 Arden Way Suite 290 Sacramento, CA 95815	Scott Wm. Weinstein Morgan & Morgan, P.A. 12800 University Drive Suite 600 P.O. Box 9504 Fort Myers, FL 33906	Brian D. Wright Faruki, Ireland & Cox, PLLC 500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W. 10 North Ludlow Street Dayton, OH 45402
Jennifer Reba Thomaidis Thomaidis Law, LLC 1866 Vine Street Denver, CO 80206	Jeff S. Westerman Milberg, Weiss & Bershad LLP One California Plaza, Suite 3900 300 South Grand Avenue Los Angeles, CA 90071	John Blim Blim & Edelson, LLC 53 West Jackson Blvd. Suite 1642 Chicago, IL 60604
Stephen R. Thomas Moffatt, Thomas, Barrett, Rock & Fields Chtd. P.O. Box 829 Boise, ID 83701	Jeffrey M. White Pierce, Atwood, LLP One Monument Square Portland, ME 04101	Perry A. Craft Craft & Sheppard, PLC The Shiloh Building 214 Centerview Drive Suite 223 Brentwood, TN 37027
Jeremy Y. Hutchinson Patton, Roberts, McWilliams & Capshaw, LLP Stephens Building 111 Center Street Suite 1315 Little Rock, AR 72201	Adam P. Karp Animal Law Offices 114 West Magnolia Street Suite 425 Bellingham, WA 98225	Eukanuba One Proctor & Gamble Plaza C-2 Cincinnati, OH 45202
Evan Nadel Squire, Sanders & Dempsey, LLP One Maritime Plaza Suite 300 San Francisco, CA 94111	Bruce E. Newman Newman, Creed & Associates 99 North Street, Route 6 P.O. Box 575 Bristol, CT 66011	Richard Fama Cozen O'Connor 45 Broadway 16th Floor New York, NY 10006
Kurt Bonds Alverson, Taylor, Mortensen & Sanders 7401 West Charleston Blvd. Las Vegas, NV 89117		